

# I. PERTURBATION THEORY FOR HARMONIC POTENTIAL WITH CUBIC ANHARMONICITY

Equations

$$\vec{\nabla}W = \lambda \vec{\nabla}H, \quad H = E \quad (1)$$

are solved here by perturbation theory, for specific functions  $H = H^{(0)} + H^{(1)}\delta$ ,  $W = W^{(0)} + W^{(1)}\delta$ , where

$$H^{(0)} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_i x_i^2, \quad H^{(1)} = \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} f_{ijk} x_i x_j x_k, \quad (2)$$

$$W^{(0)} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_i \alpha_i \bar{x}_i^2, \quad W^{(1)} = \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_i \bar{x}_j \bar{x}_k. \quad (3)$$

Here,  $x_i$  are variables collecting coordinates and momenta,  $\bar{x}_i = x_i - X_i$ ,  $X_i$  are corresponding displacements, and  $\delta$  is a perturbation parameter. Eq. (1) is equivalent to

$$\alpha_i \bar{x}_i + \frac{\delta}{2} \sum_{j,k} \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_j \bar{x}_k = \lambda \left( x_i + \frac{\delta}{2} \sum_{j,k} f_{ijk} x_j x_k \right), \quad (4)$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_i x_i^2 + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} f_{ijk} x_i x_j x_k = E. \quad (5)$$

Unknown variables are  $x_i$  ( $i = 1, \dots, M$ ) and Lagrange multiplier  $\lambda$ . They are searched in the form

$$x_i = x_i^{(0)} + x_i^{(1)}\delta + o(\delta), \quad (6)$$

$$\lambda = \lambda^{(0)} + \lambda^{(1)}\delta + o(\delta). \quad (7)$$

In zero order approximation ( $\delta = 0$ ), Eq. (4), (5) are

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_i \bar{x}_i^{(0)} &= \lambda^{(0)} x_i^{(0)}, \quad (i = 1, \dots, M) \\ \frac{1}{2} \sum_i x_i^{(0)2} &= E, \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

where  $\bar{x}_i^{(0)} = x_i^{(0)} - X_i$ .

In the first order in  $\delta$ , Eq. (4), (5) are

$$\alpha_i x_i^{(1)} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k} \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_j \bar{x}_k = \lambda^{(0)} \left( x_i^{(1)} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k} f_{ijk} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} \right) + \lambda^{(1)} x_i^{(0)}, \quad (i = 1, \dots, M) \quad (9)$$

$$\sum_i x_i^{(0)} x_i^{(1)} + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} f_{ijk} x_i^{(0)} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} = 0. \quad (10)$$

## II. FINDING THE MINIMUM OF $W$ IN HARMONIC APPROXIMATION

Let us rearrange variables  $(x_i, X_i, \alpha_i)$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, M$ ) so that  $\alpha_1$  the minimal among the set of all  $\alpha_i$ . Let us define a function

$$F(\lambda) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^M \left( \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \lambda} \right)^2 X_i^2. \quad (11)$$

We consider the function  $F(\lambda)$  as a function defined on the interval  $(-\infty, \alpha_1]$  where it monotonously increases from 0 to  $\infty$  or to  $E_1 = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=2}^M \left( \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \alpha_1} \right)^2 X_i^2$  in a special case of  $X_1 = 0$ . According to results given in Appendix, finding the minimum is as follows. Let us consider separately two cases: (1)  $X_1 \neq 0$  or  $X_1 = 0$  and  $E \leq E_1$ , (2) a specific case when  $X_1 = 0$  and  $E > E_1$ .

(1) Firstly, locate the point  $\lambda_* = F^{-1}(E)$  where  $F^{-1}$  is a function inverse to  $F$ , i.e. solve the equation  $F(\lambda_*) = E$ . Since  $F(\lambda)$  is a monotonous function, the point  $\lambda_*$  is defined uniquely. Coordinates of the minimum are expressed through  $\lambda_*$  as

$$x_i = \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} X_i, \quad (12)$$

and minimum of the function  $W$

$$W_{\min} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^M \alpha_i \left( \frac{\lambda_*}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} \right)^2 X_i^2. \quad (13)$$

(2) Coordinates of the minimum are

$$x_i = \begin{cases} \pm [2(E - E_1)]^{1/2}, & i = 1 \\ \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \alpha_1} X_i, & i \neq 1 \end{cases} \quad (14)$$

and minimum of the function  $W$  is

$$W_{\min} = \alpha_1 E - \frac{\alpha_1}{2} \sum_{i=2}^M \frac{\alpha_i X_i^2}{\alpha_i - \alpha_1}. \quad (15)$$

There are two symmetrical minima, in contrast to the case (1) when the global minimum is single.

### III. THE FIRST CORRECTION TO THE HARMONIC APPROXIMATION

#### A. Case (1)

Unperturbed coordinates and the Lagrange multiplier are

$$x_i^{(0)} = \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} X_i, \quad \lambda^{(0)} = \lambda_*, \quad (16)$$

where  $\lambda_*$  is the minimal root of an equation  $\frac{1}{2} \sum_i \left( \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \lambda} \right)^2 X_i^2 = E$ .

Now, let us find  $x_i^{(1)}$  and  $\lambda^{(1)}$  using Eq. (9) and (10). It follows from (9) that

$$x_i^{(1)} = \frac{1}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} \left[ \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k} \left( \lambda_* f_{ijk} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} - \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_j^{(0)} \bar{x}_k^{(0)} \right) + \lambda^{(1)} x_i^{(0)} \right], \quad (17)$$

or alternatively after substitution of (16) into (17)

$$x_i^{(1)} = \frac{\lambda_*}{2(\alpha_i - \lambda_*)} \sum_{j,k} \frac{X_j X_k}{(\alpha_j - \lambda_*)(\alpha_k - \lambda_*)} (f_{ijk} \alpha_j \alpha_k - \beta_{ijk} \lambda_*) + \frac{\alpha_i}{(\alpha_i - \lambda_*)^2} X_i \lambda^{(1)}. \quad (18)$$

Inserting (17) into (10), we find

$$\lambda^{(1)} = \frac{1}{6} \left( \sum_i \frac{x_i^{(0)2}}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} \right)^{-1} \sum_{i,j,k} \frac{x_i^{(0)}}{\alpha_i - \lambda_*} \left[ 3\beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_j^{(0)} \bar{x}_k^{(0)} - 2(\lambda_* + \alpha_i) f_{ijk} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} \right], \quad (19)$$

or alternatively, after substitution of  $x_i^{(0)}$  and  $x_i^{(1)}$  into (19)

$$\lambda^{(1)} = \left( \sum_i \frac{\alpha_i^2 X_i^2}{(\alpha_i - \lambda_*)^3} \right)^{-1} \quad (20)$$

$$\times \sum_{i,j,k} \left( \frac{\lambda_*^2}{2} \beta_{ijk} - \frac{2\lambda_* + \alpha_i}{6} \alpha_i \alpha_j f_{ijk} \right) \frac{\alpha_i X_i X_j X_k}{(\alpha_i - \lambda_*)^2 (\alpha_j - \lambda_*) (\alpha_k - \lambda_*)}. \quad (21)$$

We can in principle find an expression of  $x_i^{(1)}$  through  $\lambda_*$  by substituting (19) or (20) into (17) or (18). Finally, expanding minimum of the function  $W$  into power series  $W_{\min} = W_{\min}^{(0)} + W_{\min}^{(1)} \delta + O(\delta^2)$ , we find that  $W_{\min}^{(0)}$  is given by a formula (13), and

$$W_{\min}^{(1)} = \sum_i \alpha_i \bar{x}_i^{(0)} x_i^{(1)} + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_i^{(0)} \bar{x}_j^{(0)} \bar{x}_k^{(0)}. \quad (22)$$

## B. Case (2)

Unperturbed coordinates and the Lagrange multiplier are

$$x_i^{(0)} = \begin{cases} \pm [2(E - E_1)]^{1/2}, & i = 1 \\ \frac{\alpha_i}{\alpha_i - \alpha_1} X_i, & i \neq 1 \end{cases}, \quad \lambda^{(0)} = \alpha_1. \quad (23)$$

For this case, it follows from (9) for  $i = 1$  that

$$\lambda^{(1)} = \frac{1}{2x_1^{(0)}} \sum_{j,k} \left( \beta_{1jk} \bar{x}_j^{(0)} \bar{x}_k^{(0)} - \alpha_1 f_{1jk} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} \right), \quad (24)$$

and from (9) for  $i \neq 1$  that

$$x_i^{(1)} = \frac{1}{\alpha_i - \alpha_1} \left[ \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j,k} \left( \alpha_1 f_{ijk} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} - \beta_{ijk} \bar{x}_j^{(0)} \bar{x}_k^{(0)} \right) + \lambda^{(1)} x_i^{(0)} \right], \quad i \neq 1. \quad (25)$$

Finally, the remaining unknown variable  $x_1^{(1)}$  can be found by substituting (25) into (10),

$$x_1^{(1)} = \frac{1}{x_1^{(0)}} \left[ \sum_{i \neq 1} \bar{x}_i^{(0)} x_i^{(1)} + \frac{1}{6} \sum_{i,j,k} f_{ijk} x_i^{(0)} x_j^{(0)} x_k^{(0)} \right]. \quad (26)$$

The second case differs from the first case in the order in which the unknown variables are found. The variable  $\lambda^{(1)}$  is determined before the variable  $x_1^{(1)}$ . It is similar to the zero-order calculations of  $\lambda^{(0)}$  and  $x_1^{(0)}$ : for the case (1) we find firstly an expression of all  $x_i$  through  $\lambda$ , and then find  $\lambda$ , but for the case (2) we find firstly  $\lambda$ , and finally  $x_1$ .

In zero order (harmonic approximation), there are two points of minimum differing by a sign of  $x_1$ , see Eq. (14) with the same  $W_{\min}$  given by (15). In the first order approximation,  $W_{\min}$  is given by (22), and it is no longer the same for the two points, corresponding to different signs in Eq. (14). So, a true minimum is the one for which (22) is smaller.